Real Parking, Paper Parking and How to Stop Confusing the Two

NEW PARTNERS FOR SMART GROWTH
FEBRUARY 2, 2012
MOTT SMITH

Civic Enterprise Associates LLC
Note:
This presentation focuses on issues particular to walking districts. But the points are applicable more broadly, too.
Part 1: Real Parking
Part 1: Real Parking

= Actual Physical Places for Cars
What can you measure about real parking?

• How many spaces are there?
What can you measure about real parking?

• How many spaces are there?
• Where exactly are they?
What can you measure about real parking?

• How many spaces are there?

• Where exactly are they?

• What kind of spaces are they? (on-street versus off-street, surface versus structure, etc.)
What can you measure about real parking?

- How many spaces are there?
- Where exactly are they?
- What kind of spaces are they? (on-street versus off-street, surface versus structure, etc.)
- Who owns them? (Public versus private, etc.)
What can you measure about real parking?

- How many spaces are there?
- Where exactly are they?
- What kind of spaces are they? (on-street versus off-street, surface versus structure, etc.)
- Who owns them? (Public versus private, etc.)
- How heavily are they used?
Santa Monica-Melrose West

Percentage of Parking Spaces Occupied Weekend

Source: CEA Survey
Despite all this, we base most everyday planning decisions
Despite all this, we base most everyday planning decisions on **paper parking**, not the real stuff.
Part 2: Paper Parking:
Part 2: **Paper Parking:**

The basis of entitlements decisions.
Part 2: **Paper Parking:**

The basis of entitlements decisions.

A lot like financial derivatives.
13. Valet parking shall be made available at all hours that the gourmet shop/deli business is open to the public.

14. Within 30 days of the effective date of this action, the applicant shall submit to the Zoning Administrator, a contract with the valet company and a letter of understanding or other agreement with the property owner of the building where such parking is to be provided, identifying the availability of parking. Noting location and number of spaces and the hours when such parking is to be available. The availability of valet parking shall be included in the menu and in any written advertising for the premises.

15. A minimum of 20 parking spaces for the exclusive use of the subject business shall be made available via the valet service. Any parking provided off-site shall not include parking which is required by the Municipal Code for any other use. Said parking shall not be for the use of employees. Parking shall be provided at 8075 West 3rd Street, as proposed by the applicant. In the event, that such parking is no
PRECISION VALET INC.
P.O. Box 9948
GLENDALE, CA 91226-0948
818-241-5011   FAX 818-241-7010

VALET PARKING AGREEMENT

This agreement ("Agreement") is entered into by and between Precision Valet Inc. ("Operator") and La Brea Dining California ("Restaurant") and is made with reference to the following facts:

A. "Restaurant" is seeking valet services.

B. "Operator" provides valet parking services of the type required by restaurant.

It is agreed.

1. Right to Operate a Valet Parking Service

Restaurant hereby grants "Operator" the right to operate a valet parking service from the Location.

2. Terms of Agreement

The term of this agreement shall commence on October 1, 2010 and shall
This is not a parking space.
This is not a parking space. 
It is just an agreement.
VALET PARKING AGREEMENT

This agreement (“Agreement”) is entered into by and between Precision Valet Inc. (“Operator”) and La Brea Dining California (“Restaurant”) and is made with reference to the following facts:

A. “Restaurant” is seeking valet services.

B. “Operator” provides valet parking services of the type required by restaurant.

It is agreed.

1. Right to Operate a Valet Parking Service

   Restaurant hereby grants “Operator” the right to operate a valet parking service from the Location.

2. Terms of Agreement

   The term of this agreement shall commence on October 1, 2018 and shall...
Illustration: A Tale of Two Restaurants
Unpopular Restaurant 1 (4,000 SF)

Vacant Building A (4,000 SF)

Unpopular Restaurant 2 (4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces

Unpopular Restaurant 3 (4,000 SF)

Vacant Building B (4,000 SF)

Unpopular Restaurant 14 (4,000 SF)

500 spaces
Illustration (not an actual case)
A Street

Unpopular Restaurant 1 (4,000 SF)

Vacant Building A (4,000 SF)

Unpopular Restaurant 2 (4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces

Unpopular Restaurant 3 (4,000 SF)

Vacant Building B (4,000 SF)

Unpopular Restaurant 14 (4,000 SF)

500 spaces
• Leased to a restaurant.
• Needs 36 spaces (9 per 1,000 SF).
• What can they do?
Option 1. Build the parking
Option 1. Keep the parking

No space or money for major construction project. City would prefer no auto traffic across sidewalk.
Option 2. Grandfathering.
Option 1: unfathering.

No prior restaurant use.
Option 3. In lieu fees.
Option 3. In lieu fees.

\[
\frac{4,000 \text{ SF}}{1,000} \times 9 = 36 \text{ spaces required.}
\]

\[
36 \times \$20,000 = \$720,000.
\]
Option: Avoid fees.

$720,000 + a custom parking study breaks the bank.
Option 4. Off-site lease for 36 spaces
Unpopular Restaurant 1 (4,000 SF)
Vacant Building A (4,000 SF)
Unpopular Restaurant 2 (4,000 SF)
Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces

Unpopular Restaurant 3 (4,000 SF)
Vacant Building B (4,000 SF)
Unpopular Restaurant 14 (4,000 SF)

500 spaces
Vacant Building A (4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces
Carwash leases 36 “paper” parking spaces to restaurant
Carwash leases 36 “paper” parking spaces to restaurant

Vacant Building A (4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces

$3,600/month
Carwash leases 36 “paper” parking spaces to restaurant

Restaurant provides City with a copy of the lease

Vacant Building A (4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces

$3,600/month
Restaurant provides City with a copy of the lease

If carwash spaces are “above code,” restaurant can be approved.

Carwash leases 36 “paper” parking spaces to restaurant

Vacant Building A (4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces

$3,600/month
Possible outcomes
Possible outcome #1

- Restaurant is moderately successful
- Most patrons park at car wash
- Actual peak utilization is 36 spaces
- Neighboring uses stay the same
- Everything is cool
Restaurant is *wildly* successful
All patrons park at car wash
Actual peak utilization 72 cars
Today, the City has no good way to tell whether Outcome #1 or Outcome #2 actually happened.

But it needs to know in order to make good decisions about future projects.

And it needs to know in order to effectively manage the public parking it controls.
Today, the City has no good way to tell whether Outcome #1 or Outcome #2 actually happened.

But it **needs to know** in order to make good decisions about future projects.

And it needs to know in order to effectively manage the public parking it controls.
Today, the City has no good way to tell whether Outcome #1 or Outcome #2 actually happened.

But it needs to know in order to make good decisions about future projects.

And it needs to know in order to **effectively manage the public parking** it controls.
Second Neighborhood Restaurant

- **New Restaurant A** (4,000 SF)
- **Vacant Building B** (4,000 SF)
- **Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces**

- Vacant Building “B” gets leased

500 spaces
Second Neighborhood Restaurant

Carwash leases 36 “paper” parking spaces to restaurant

Vacant Building B (4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash With “72” parking spaces
Carwash leases 36 “paper” parking spaces to restaurant

Second Neighborhood Restaurant

Vacant Building B
(4,000 SF)

Mysterious Car Wash
With “72” parking spaces

$3,600/month
Carwash leases 36 "paper" parking spaces to restaurant.

Mysterious Car Wash
With "72" parking spaces

Vacant Building B
(4,000 SF)

$3,600/month

Applicant provides City with a copy of the lease.
What does the City do now?

Is there enough parking at the car wash or isn’t there?
This is where the process can get ugly.
So why do we put our planning staff and project applicants through this craziness?
1. Because that’s what the code says.
OFF-STREET PARKING AND LOADING § 26-22

Type of Occupancy

o. Arcade or game room
p. Billiard hall

Class 7. Bar or Restaurant:

a. Restaurant (including outdoor decks, patio and/or seating areas)

b. Bar, club or lounge (including outdoor decks, patio and/or seating areas)

Class 8. Retail Services:

a. Supermarket or convenience market
b. Clothing store
c. Furniture store
d. Retail store (freestanding)
e. Building materials or home improvement store
f. Barber or beauty shop
g. Shopping center (strip) (up to 25,000 GFA)

h. Shopping center (neighborhood) (25,001—100,000)
i. Shopping center (community) (100,001—399,999)
j. Shopping center (regional) (400,000—1,000,000 GFA)
k. Shopping center (super regional) (over 1,000,000 GFA)
l. Discount store

Class 9. Automobiles:

a. Auto sales dealer
b. Auto repair establishment
c. Car wash (automated)
d. Car wash (all other)
e. Service station
f. Auto parts and supply store

Parking Spaces

1.0 space for every 200 square feet of GFA
2.0 spaces for every billiard table

8.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA and outdoor decks, patio and/or seating areas in excess of 10% of gross floor area
10.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA and outdoor decks, patio and/or seating areas

5.0 space for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
4.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
2.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
4.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA and retail sales area
3.0 spaces for each operator chair and 1.0 space for each employee
4.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA, except the increment of GFA used for a bar, club or lounge shall provide the equivalent of 10 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
4.0 spaces per 1,000 square feet of GFA, plus increment
4.0 spaces per 1,000 square feet of GFA
5.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
4.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
4.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA

5.5 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
5.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA
2.5 spaces for each bay or stall for stacking space
1.0 space per stall
3.0 spaces for each service stall and 1.0 space for each employee on duty during largest shift
4.0 spaces for every 1,000 square feet of GFA of retail sales area.

2. Because we think more *off-street* parking means less on-street congestion.
2. Because we think more *off-street* parking means less on-street congestion.

(and this is patently false)
Santa Monica-Melrose West

Percentage of Parking Spaces Occupied Weekend

Source: CEA Survey
Santa Monica-Melrose West

Number of Vacant Spaces Weekend

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Private Off-Street</th>
<th>Metered Spaces</th>
<th>Municipal Off-Street</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11am</td>
<td>603</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1pm</td>
<td>585</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3pm</td>
<td>563</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5pm</td>
<td>591</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7pm</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9pm</td>
<td>733</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11pm</td>
<td>789</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1am</td>
<td>757</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
- Green: Private Off-Street
- Blue: Metered Spaces
- Pink: Municipal Off-Street
3. And if there *really* is enough off-street supply already, project applicants should be able to prove it—and guarantee it.
4. Because some mistakenly believe we can trade reduced parking requirements for community benefits.
4. Because some mistakenly believe we can trade reduced parking requirements for community benefits.

(But less parking = lower values = nothing to trade)
Example: AB 710: Reduced parking requirements near transit
Sources: L.A. Housing Dept., L.A. Dept. of Building & Safety, SCAG
Units in Density Bonus Projects, City of L.A., 2005-2010

Sources: L.A. Housing Dept., L.A. Dept. of Building & Safety, SCAG
How does a reliance on paper parking create issues?
It can be extraordinarily complicated to track.
It can be extraordinarily complicated to track.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Monday to Friday</th>
<th>Saturday</th>
<th>Sunday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 am to 11 a.m.</td>
<td>83 cars for building 20 cars/Little</td>
<td>10 cars for building 20 cars</td>
<td>2 cars for building 20 cars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Next Door</td>
<td>for Little Next Door</td>
<td>for Little Next Door</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 a.m. to 5 p.m.</td>
<td>63 cars for building 20 cars for</td>
<td>10 cars for building 20 cars</td>
<td>2 cars for building 20 cars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Little Next Door</td>
<td>for Little Next Door</td>
<td>for Little Next Door</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 p.m. to 6 p.m.</td>
<td>20 cars for building 20 cars for</td>
<td>5 cars for building 20 cars</td>
<td>20 cars for Little</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Little Next Door</td>
<td>for Little Next Door</td>
<td>Next Door</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 p.m. to 9:30 p.m.</td>
<td>10 cars for building 20 cars for</td>
<td>20 cars for Little Next Door</td>
<td>20 cars for Little Next Door</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Little Next Door</td>
<td>24 cars for AOC Restaurant</td>
<td>24 cars for AOC Restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30 p.m. to 12 p.m.</td>
<td>5 cars for building 24 cars for AOC</td>
<td>24 cars for AOC Restaurant</td>
<td>24 cars for AOC Restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Schedule for parking lot located at 8075 West Third Street
Just because an applicant leases offsite parking doesn’t mean they use it.
Just because it’s leased doesn’t mean anyone parks in it.
. . . Unless they’re being photographed . . .
Moreover, people look at real parking to assess conditions in their neighborhood.

Source: CEA Survey of Santa Monica-Melrose West, West Hollywood
Moreover, people look at **real parking** to assess conditions in their neighborhood.
Human behavior thus determines the state of real parking in any neighborhood.

And all the paper parking in the world cannot change that.
Percentage of Parking Spaces Occupied Weekend

Source: CEA Survey of Santa Monica-Melrose West, West Hollywood
So what is a planner to do?
1. Make paper parking much more representative of real parking.
Old Pasadena Parking District
Old Pasadena

Source: www.railroadarchive.net/IA00_goldline.html
“Parking Credits”

• Typically, one credit satisfies one space requirement. (Possible to create daytime and nighttime standards)

• Building owners “lease” credits from the City.

• Creates “park once” neighborhoods, more efficient use of resources, less expensive and more predictable than alternatives.

• Better way to manage development and parking in destination districts
“Parking Credits”

• Born in Pasadena (ht Marsha Rood)
• Implemented on a pilot basis in L.A.
• Enabled in the West Hollywood General Plan Update
2. Understand that managing entitlements is not the same as managing parking.

(i.e., pricing, hours, etc.)
Percentage of Parking Spaces Occupied Weekend

Source: CEA Survey of Santa Monica-Melrose West, West Hollywood
Sunset Strip West
Percentage of Parking Spaces Occupied Weekend

Source: CEA Survey
3. Engage with parking operators and managers to create comprehensive strategies for entitlements and operations.
4. Use data to trump politics.
TRANSPORTATION

MOTION

The Eagle Rock area of Los Angeles is an older community with pedestrian-scaled commercial businesses located along Colorado Boulevard and Eagle Rock Boulevard. These businesses are often located in buildings that were built before the establishment of current City parking requirements. Efforts to retain and enhance the pedestrian-oriented character of the commercial area has been difficult when current parking requirements do not fit with the community’s goals.

Without these efforts it is difficult to retain and enhance the pedestrian-oriented character of the commercial area. Therefore, the City should explore the possibility of implementing a Community Parking Pilot Project to examine parking options that attract the types of businesses that are desired by the Eagle Rock business and residential communities. The pilot project should be designed to protect and enhance the pedestrian character of the commercial streets in the Colorado Specific Plan Area, as well as the character of the adjacent residential neighborhoods.

I THEREFORE MOVE that the City Council direct the Department of Transportation, in coordination with the Department of City Planning, to develop a Community Parking Pilot Project consistent with the Colorado Boulevard Specific Plan that will provide parking options to enhance the pedestrian-oriented businesses seeking to locate in that area.

PRESENTED BY: Antonio Villaraigosa Councilmember, 14th District

SECONDED BY:
Thank You